

CITY AND COUNTY OF SWANSEA

NOTICE OF MEETING

You are invited to attend a Meeting of the

CORPORATE SERVICES CABINET ADVISORY COMMITTEE

At: Committee Room 5, Guildhall, Swansea

On: Wednesday, 9 March 2016

Time: 4.00 pm

Chair: Councillor Erika Kirchner

Membership:

Councillors: J E Burtonshaw, J A Hale, T J Hennegan, Y V Jardine, A J Jones, D J Lewis, M Thomas and L V Walton

AGENDA

Page No.

- | | | |
|----------|---|---------------|
| 1 | Apologies for Absence. | |
| 2 | Disclosures of Personal and Prejudicial Interests.
www.swansea.gov.uk/DisclosuresofInterests | |
| 3 | Minutes.
To approve & sign the Minutes of the previous meeting(s) as a correct record. | 1 - 4 |
| 4 | Councillor Champion Update. | 5 |
| 5 | Proposed Gender Pay Gap Project. | 6 - 11 |
| 6 | Work Programme 2015-2016. | 12 |

Next Meeting: Wednesday, 13 April 2016 at 4.00 pm



Patrick Arran
Head of Legal and Democratic Services
Wednesday, 2 March 2016

Contact: Democratic Services: - 636923

CITY AND COUNTY OF SWANSEA

MINUTES OF THE CORPORATE SERVICES CABINET ADVISORY COMMITTEE

HELD AT COMMITTEE ROOM 5, GUILDHALL, SWANSEA ON
WEDNESDAY, 13 JANUARY 2016 AT 4.00 PM

PRESENT: Councillor E T Kirchner (Chair) Presided

Councillor(s)
J A Hale

Councillor(s)
M Thomas

Councillor(s)
L V Walton

Officer(s)

Mike Hawes	- Head of Finance & Delivery / Section 151 Officer
Steve Rees	- Head of Human Resources
Deb Yeates	- Principal HR Officer
Jeremy Parkhouse	- Democratic Services Officer

Apologies for Absence

Councillor(s): J E Burtonshaw and T J Hennegan

27 **DISCLOSURES OF PERSONAL AND PREJUDICIAL INTERESTS.**

In accordance with the provisions of the Code of conduct adopted by the City and County of Swansea, no interests were declared.

28 **MINUTES.**

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 9 December 2015 be agreed as a correct record.

29 **INVEST TO SAVE LOANS.**

The Head of Finance and Delivery provided the Committee with a verbal update regarding Invest to Save Loans. He stated that the Welsh Government had introduced the loans in 2011 and all public sector bodies can bid for money. The purpose of the loans were to improve efficiency by delivering projects that were designed to make cash savings.

He added that while Swansea had not applied, a number of other local authorities and public bodies in Wales had been granted loans and he gave examples of some of the schemes the loans had been used to support. However, that the loans were non-negotiable and were repayable over 3 years and the successful applicant must put 25% towards the overall cost. Less than 5% of local authorities had generated enough savings to make the loan repayments.

He stated that because of the way the Council had managed its budget, particularly in 2013/14, there was sufficient cash in the contingency fund to pay for any schemes the Authority wished to pursue.

The Committee asked a number of questions of the Officer who responded accordingly. Discussions centred around the following: -

- How the Authority could utilise a loan, including examples of possible schemes;
- Schemes undertaken by the Authority that could have benefitted from a loan which were financed by the contingency fund;
- Any potential schemes being highlighted;
- Financial outlook of the Authority in the next few years.

The Chair thanked the Head of Finance and Delivery for providing his report.

RESOLVED that the contents of the report be noted.

30 **ANALYSIS OF FEMALE WORKFORCE.**

The Head of Human Resources presented a report on Analysis of the Female Workforce. An analysis of the gender breakdown of the Council workforce was provided.

It was proposed that the Committee consider discussing the issue with 'Women Adding Value to the Economy' (WAVE) with a view to possibly engaging their services.

It was outlined that Women Adding Value to the Economy (WAVE) had been created to address workplace and labour market practices, specifically gender earning disparities in employment and self-employment. The aim of the WAVE programme was to contribute to tackling the causes of gender pay gaps in Wales. Their aim is to achieve this through both interrelated and targeted activities, working with employers, employees and self-employed women. WAVE is funded by the Convergence European Social Fund through the Welsh Government.

The three main strands of the WAVE programme are were detailed as follows:

- Cardiff University will develop tools and techniques based on research with employers to challenge gender based inequalities in organisations. With particular attention to pay inequalities, the aim being to replace them with a more equitable system
- The Women's Workshop Project BAWSO Ltd aims to empower and upskill women to progress in and move into non-traditional sectors and technical career paths, to access higher valued and better paid areas of work.
- The University of South Wales aims to empower and to up-skill women who are either already in, or aiming towards self-employment. Encouraging and enabling them to achieve higher levels of remuneration.

WAVE had recently undertaken a case study in Rhondda Cynon Taff Council.

The Committee asked questions of the Officer who responded accordingly.

Discussions centred around the following: -

- Workforce data contained at Appendix 1 including age profile, length of service profile and contract type by gender;
- The assistance that could be provided by WAVE;
- How the personal circumstances of women differ to men;
- Barriers encountered by women compared to men.

RESOLVED that: -

- 1) The contents of the report be noted;
- 2) A meeting with a representative of the WAVE Programme be arranged with Officers and the Chair to discuss the issue further.

31 **AGENCY WORKERS.**

The Head of Human Resources presented a report on Agency Workers which detailed of the use of Agency Workers within the Authority and to investigate the merits of developing an 'in house' agency service.

It was outlined that the Authority currently had 232 Agency Workers being used in various Departments. A breakdown of all agency workers as at 30 November 2015 was provided. The two main Contractors are RSD and Select who were the successful tenderers for the corporate contract.

The majority of Agency Workers were used in the Waste Management Service area. Some of these were long standing Agency Workers and approximately 20 of these had been employed on a permanent basis during 2015. The Waste Management Commissioning Review would be looking at the remainder of these Agency Workers.

It was noted that since October 2011, Agency Workers had been entitled to equal treatment on basic working and employment conditions as if they had been recruited directly by the Council, once they had been in the same job for 12 calendar weeks.

'Equal treatment' means Agency Workers are entitled to:

- Access to the same basic pay based on the annual salary the Agency Worker would get if recruited directly by us. The pay will include holiday pay, overtime allowances and bonus payments (whilst the Council still pays them). Pay does not include occupational sick pay, but they are entitled to statutory sick pay
- Access to the same holiday entitlement, working time, overtime, breaks and rest periods as permanent workers
- Equal access to collective facilities – this is a day 1 entitlement

- Access to information about internal vacancies to give them the same opportunity as other workers to find permanent employment– this is a day 1 entitlement; and
- Equal access to on-site facilities such as canteen facilities and transport services – this is a day 1 entitlement.

The Council has an Agency Workers Policy which was implemented on 1 April 2014.

In addition to Agency Workers, Social Services have their own Team of workers, i.e. the RST Team. The team was established in 2007. These are a team of approx. 38 staff which were employed by the Authority, on a casual basis to cover for holidays and sickness. They are used on an as and when needed basis. These staff are paid the rate of pay for the position and do progress through the grade of the post that they are undertaking. The service only uses these staff if they were unable to use employed staff to cover the shifts. The Service should only use external Agency workers where there was an urgent need and they were unable to engage current staff or RST.

The Committee asked questions of the Officer who responded accordingly. Discussions centred around the following: -

- Benefits of having an 'in-house' agency pool based on the Social Services RST Model;
- Commissioning Review of Waste Management;
- Management implications of having an 'in-house' agency;
- Scheme being piloted in Social Services.

RESOLVED that: -

- 1) The contents of the report be noted;
- 2) Further discussions take place following the completion of the Commissioning Review of Waste Management.

32 **WORK PROGRAMME 2015-2016.**

The Chair presented an update Work Programme 2015-2016.

RESOLVED that: -

- 1) The contents of the report be noted;
- 2) A presentation by WAVE be added to the agenda of the meeting scheduled for 10 February 2016;
- 3) The Leader and Cabinet Member for Transformation and Performance be invited to the meeting scheduled for 10 February 2016 to discuss future work topics.

The meeting ended at 5.30 pm

CHAIR

Report of the Chair

Corporate Services Cabinet Advisory Committee – 9 March 2016

LIST OF COUNCILLOR CHAMPIONS

Councillor Champion For	Post Held By Councillor	Date Reported to CAC
Armed Forces	June Burtonshaw	10 June 2015
Biodiversity	Mark Child	
Carers	Paulette Smith	
Children and Young People	Christine Richards	
Councillor Support and Development	Clive Lloyd	11 November 2015
Disabled People	Paul Lloyd	14 October 2015
Diversity	Erika Kirchner	
Domestic Abuse	Erika Kirchner	12 August 2015
Gender, Gender Reassignment and Sexual Orientation	Elliot King	
Health and Wellbeing	Jane Harris	
Healthy Cities	Mark Child	
Language (Welsh)	Paul Meara	
Older People	Jan Curtice	9 March 2016
Race, Religion, Belief and Heritage	Yvonne Jardine	
United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC)	Christine Richards	

Agenda Item 5

Briefing Note of Head of Human Resources & Organisation Development

Corporate Services Cabinet Advisory Committee – 9 March 2016

PROPOSED GENDER PAY GAP PROJECT

1. Context

- 1.1 This Briefing Note provides an update to the discussion that took place at the Corporate Services Cabinet Advisory Committee on 13th January 2016 where an analysis of the gender of the Council workforce was provided.
- 1.2 The Welsh Specific Equality Regulations 2011, the so-called 'Equal Pay Duty' requires the Council to address not only disparities of pay but also to address the structural labour market factors that can cause gender pay gaps.
- 1.3 With this in mind, the Head of HR&OD invited Dr Alison Parken of Cardiff University, the leading research specialist in this area, to talk to Councillor Kirchner and HROD Officers about the research she has undertaken with 3 public sector organisations in Wales, including a Local Authority in South East Wales. A copy of the presentation provided by Dr Parker is attached at Appendix 1.

2. Research into Gender Pay Gaps in Wales – Findings Summary

- 2.1 The research has highlighted a number of issues, particularly the way that the public sector structures jobs and contractual working hours may be contributing to a gender pay gap that could contravene the Equal Pay Duty.
- 2.2 For example, in the Council studied, an analysis of grades 1-3 (lowest paid posts) indicated that women held part time posts while their male counterparts held full time posts, suggesting an inequality in opportunities for career progression. This is due to the traditional notion of 'women's work' being part time, as it is assumed that women prefer this type of work. The research found that this was not the case, as many women undertaking part time work have more than one part time post in order to build their earnings.
- 2.3 More importantly, however, the evidence shows that permanent full time posts are predominantly held by male employees, but the majority of local authority staff are female. This indicates that the way we structure our posts and offer contracted work *could be* contributing to a potential gender pay gap because of the way we are structuring work within the Council.

3. Suggested Actions

- 3.1 The Cabinet Advisory Committee recommends to the Cabinet Member that a project is undertaken to understand our current Gender Pay situation, not only to comply with the Equal Pay Duty regulations, but to assist us with

moving forward to ensuring that we become an organisation that addresses the any potential gender inequalities within the workforce. The Council will be able to utilise the toolkit provided by Dr Parker but at this point in time we are unable to engage her services until the funding for WAVE has been confirmed by them.

- 3.2 We are currently developing a HR Analytics Project that is working on building better workforce data and workforce reporting. The Head of HR&OD suggests that the Gender Pay Gap project is added to this wider programme in order to ensure compliance going forward, with the aim to provide an analysis of any potential gender pay gaps and potential employment practices that could contribute to gender inequality.
- 3.3 Regular updates will be provided to the Cabinet Advisory Committee.

Steve Rees
Head of HR&OD
25th February 2016






Local Government: Joint Council for
Wales
WAVE Local Government Case Study

Dr Alison Parken
14th October 2015

Gender Pay Disparities

'Pay disparity results from a combination of differences in the ways men and women are employed. These factors include employment segregation (by sector, occupation, workplace hierarchy, contract type (permanent/casual, full or part time or fixed hours), the undervaluing of 'women's work', access to training and routes to progression, the unequal division of labour between paid and unpaid work, labour market structuring on the assumption of gender roles regarding childcare and adult dependent care in the working age years, and pay discrimination' (Parken et.al 2009).





Why this research and action



- Welsh Specific Equality Regulations 2011 - 'Equal Pay Duty' - structural labour market factors need to be addressed to close gender pay gaps
- Employers have some of the levers – must collect and analyse workforce and pay data
- WAVE Research – How to do the analysis, interpret, and act
- Develop GEPA method - all employers can replicate the analysis

Overview of the employment

- Commitment to equality, JE, spot salaries - no pay gaps within grades.
- 26% of all GR posts are full time, 74% part time
- 8535 women, 2590 men - women hold 76% of all posts
- But only 47% of all full time posts, and 93% of part time, 73% of casual posts
- FT work = 60% of men's employment, 17% of women's
- Men are more likely to be employed as casuals than part time workers
- PT = 65% of women's employment, 16% of men's
- Women hold 85% of all P and T Term Time only Contracts = 63% of women's part time contracts (EDLL).
- 11% of women had 2 or more part time/casual contracts

Contract distribution by gender

	Men	% of men's employment	Women	% of women's employment	Total
P FT	1554	60%	1383	16.2%	2937
T FT	77	3%	85	1%	162
P TT	17	0.7	134	1.6	151
T TT	13	0.5	26	0.3	39
P PT	173	6.7	1009	11.8	1182
T PT	34	1.3	147	1.7	181
P PT TT	78	3	2056	24	2134
T PT TT	92	3.6	1441	16.9	1533
P PT X	50	2	870	10.20	920
T PT X	4	0.14	17	0.2	21
Casual	498	19.3	1367	16.2	1865
Total	2590	100	8535	100	11,125

Length of time in part time job

- Women

	tenure	Co tenure	Post tenure
PPT	11.27	12.44	6.42
TPT	2.98	4.02	2.27
PPTX	12.58	13.03	7.94
TPTX	5.88	6.15	3.15
PTTT	10.32	11.52	5.50
TPTT	3.5	4.73	2.50
Casual	2.60	3.67	2.44

PT and FT and grading

- In GR1-3, 99% of women work on a part time or casual basis compared to 74% of men.
- Men hold 80% of all the full time jobs in GR 1-3
- As grades rise women are more likely to be employed full time – specialisms.
- GR8+ accounts for 54% of all women’s full time work, 38% of men’s.
- Higher graded work more likely to be FT and route to progression
- Over a quarter of men are contracted (all types) at Grade 8 and above (26%), in comparison to 12% of women.
- 198 women (GR8+) on P PT contracts (34 men)
positive indicator but career progression or have to go back FT to advance?

Results, Employer Case Studies: Summary Findings (Parken *et.al.* 2015)




- Recruitment, collaboration agreements, relationship building, data collation and cleaning, analysis, interpretation, change
- All had undertaken Job Evaluation and Gender Pay audits – low or no hourly pay gaps
- Total stock of full time jobs – key and by gender composition
Men over-represented in share of Permanent Full Time jobs
- Women’s dominance of public sector due to concentration in ‘women’s work’ in low banded, part time and more temporary contract types, fixed term, temp., casual
- Grades 1-3 - women part time in care, cleaning and catering, clerical, teaching assistants – progression?
- Men in grades 1-3 - full time in caretaking, maintenance, portering, landscaping


Results, Employer Case Studies cont’d



- Women more likely to hold 2+ jobs to build earnings
- Question: choice and PT hours restriction?
- Stuck. Routes out? Training?
- Men over-represented in senior grades
- Qualifications lever more necessary for women to attain FT work/progress
- FT work route to progression/higher grades
- Some high graded PT work - career progression?
- Analysis demonstrated the combined impact of men and women working in different jobs, different grades, contracts and working patterns as producing/sustaining gender pay gaps
- Acting on evidence





Change Actions Underway – LG




Change Actions owned by a WAVE senior management team, and situated as workforce development and planning issue.


Communications- Commitment communicated to all staff through pay slip note.

- Horizontal Segregation
- Review JDs/recruitment images
- Job swapping/shadowing – throughout organization and not just at career start
- Working Patterns/ Contracts Segregation
- Remove FT/PT label
- PT in Bands 1 – 3 - consult Line Managers re progression/skills/train and impact of welfare transfers
- Consult staff in these grades re casual working/multiple contracts/progression/welfare
- Vertical segregation
- Suite of Flexible Working Practices including agile working, compressed hours, annualized hours, job share/talent pool, purchase of additional leave and career breaks.
- Unconscious bias training
- Returners Review - opportunities to progress in part time work at bottom and top of hierarchy
- Action plans to 2017



WAVE II



- Scientific assessment of impact of change actions within current current collaborating employers and impact on pay gaps overall, continue to support their changes
- Scale: Train employers to produce employment and pay disparity results through GEPA
- Interpretation
- Support them to act on evidence
- UK Equal Pay Barometer
- Inform equality work in structural funds



Sources of information



WAVE Employer Case Study Reports (Parken 2015)
Working Patterns in Wales: Gender, Occupations and Pay, Source: ONS, APS 2004-2010 (Parken, A., Pocher, E., and Davies, R., 2014)

- <http://www.cardiff.ac.uk/research/explore/research-units/women-adding-value-to-the-economy-wave>

Equal Pay Barometer

- <http://www.wavewales.co.uk/equal-pay-barometer/>

Agenda Item 6

Report of the Chair

Corporate Services Cabinet Advisory Committee – 9 March 2016

CORPORATE SERVICES CABINET ADVISORY COMMITTEE – WORK PROGRAMME 2015/16

Date	Subject Area	Lead
14 October 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Councillor Champion Update • Presentation – Helping Hands • Staff Engagement Feedback 	Councillor Paul Lloyd Helen Lewis Steve Rees / Deb Yeates
11 November 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Councillor Champion Update • Discussions with the Cabinet Member for Transformation & Performance 	Councillor Clive Lloyd Councillor Clive Lloyd
9 December 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Feedback regarding the staff survey • Survey for smoke free spaces • Presentation - Equality and Welsh Language Update 	Lee Wenham Chris Steele Sherill Hopkins & Phil Couch
13 January 2016	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Invest to Save Grants • Analysis of the Female Workforce • Agency Workers 	Mike Hawes Steve Rees Steve Rees
9 March 2016	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Councillor Champion Update • Update - Analysis of the Female Workforce 	Councillor Jan Curtice Steve Rees
13 April 2016	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Councillor Champion Update 	